

ELIZABETH A. STRANGE
First Assistant United States Attorney
District of Arizona

KRISTEN BROOK
Arizona State Bar No. 023121
JOSEPH E. KOEHLER
Arizona State Bar No. 013288
Assistant U.S. Attorneys
Two Renaissance Square
40 N. Central Ave., Suite 1800
Phoenix, Arizona 85004
Telephone: 602-514-7500
Email: kristen.brook@usdoj.gov
Email: joe.koehler@usdoj.gov
Attorneys for Plaintiff

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

United States of America,

Plaintiff,

V.

Abdul Malik Abdul Kareem,

Defendant.

No. CR-15-00707-01-PHX-SRB

**RESPONSE TO DEFENDANT'S MOTION
TO PRECLUDE GOVERNMENT *EX
PARTE* SUBMISSION UNDER CIPA
ABSENT DEFENSE PARTICIPATION**

The United States, through undersigned counsel, respectfully urges the Court to deny Kareem's Supplemental Motion to Preclude Government *Ex Parte* Submission Under CIPA Absent Defense Participation (CR 522). The government respectfully submits the motion is moot because the government does not anticipate any filings under the Classified Information Procedures Act (CIPA) at this time. In light of the instant motion, however, should undersigned counsel come to anticipate a new CIPA filing is in this case, undersigned counsel will provide general notice to the defense in advance of such a filing in order to enable the defense to file a renewed motion.

Further, although the government would agree that a defense *ex parte* presentation to the Court on anticipated defenses may be appropriate in some circumstances prior to

1 trial, the instant motion addresses post-trial discovery requests and litigation. The
2 defendant has revealed, both at trial and in post-trial filings and letters, the defenses to
3 which their discovery demands relate. *See CR 524, Exh. 1.* Any additional justifications
4 for deeming information relevant and helpful under Rule 16, exculpatory under *Brady v.*
5 *Maryland*, 373 U.S. 83 (1963), or impeachment evidence under *Giglio v. United States*,
6 405 U.S. 150 (1972), should be provided to government counsel and not submitted *ex*
7 *parte*. Further, the government respectfully suggests the defense should supply authority
8 articulating the precise legal basis for the claimed defense theory.

9 Respectfully submitted this 11th day of February, 2019.

10 ELIZABETH A. STRANGE
11 First Assistant United States Attorney
12 District of Arizona

13 *s/ Kristen Brook*
14 *s/ Joseph E. Koehler*
15 KRISTEN BROOK
16 JOSEPH E. KOEHLER
17 Assistant U.S. Attorneys

18
19 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

20
21 I hereby certify that on the 11th day of February, 2019, I electronically filed the
22 foregoing with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system, and that true and accurate
23 copies have been transmitted electronically to counsel for the defendant via the ECF
24 system.

25 Daniel Drake & Daniel Maynard, Attorneys for Defendant

26 By: */s Joseph E. Koehler*

27

28